The Economic, Political, and Social Impacts of Bioterrorism

MICHAEL D. INTRILIGATOR
PROFESSOR OF ECONOMICS,
POLITICAL SCIENCE, AND PUBLIC
POLICY, UCLA
AND SENIOR FELLOW
THE MILKEN INSTITUTE
My chapter in our forthcoming book

GLOBAL BIOSECURITY AND HEALTH CARE
PREPAREDNESS: A NETWORKED
GLOBAL APPROACH
EDITED BY PETER KATONA, JOHN P.
SULLIVAN AND MICHAEL D.
INTRILIGATOR
SEQUEL TO OUR EARLIER BOOK
COUNTERING TERRORISM AND WMD,
TAYLOR & FRANCIS, LONDON, 2006
Overview

1. THE THREAT OF BIOTERRORISM
2. POTENTIAL EFFECTS OF BIOTERRORISM
3. POTENTIAL AL QAEDA USE OF BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS
4. THE EVOLVING NATURE OF TRANSNATIONAL TERRORISM
5. COUNTERING BIOTERRORISM: THE ROLE OF MUTUAL SUPPORT
1. The threat of bioterrorism

- ONE OF THE GREATEST THREATS IN THE WORLD TODAY: THE POTENTIAL FOR TRANSNATIONAL TERRORIST GROUPS, SUCH AS AL QAEDA, TO ACQUIRE AND USE WEAPONS OF MASS DESTRUCTION (WMD)

- WMD INCLUDE NUCLEAR, BIOLOGICAL AND CHEMICAL WEAPONS; IMPORTANT DIFFERENCES AMONG THEM; MOST DANGEROUS ARE NUCLEAR AND BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS

- INADEQUATE ATTENTION HAS BEEN PAID TO BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS
1. The threat of bioterrorism (continued)


• UN SPECIAL COMMISSION REPORT OF 1995 NOTED THAT IRAQ HAD STOCKPILED BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS AND DELIVERY SYSTEMS BETWEEN 1988 AND 1991
1. The threat of bioterrorism (continued)

- DISCOVERY IN 1995 THAT THE JAPANESE EXTREMIST GROUP AUM SHINRIKIYO THAT CARRIED OUT AN ATTACK THAT YEAR ON THE TOKYO SUBWAY USING NERVE GAS HAD ALSO BEEN ATTEMPTING TO PRODUCE BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS

- ANTHRAX ATTACKS IN THE U.S. FOLLOWING THE SEPTEMBER 11, 2001 AL QAEDA ATTACKS ON THE WORLD TRADE CENTER AND THE PENTAGON
2. Potential effects of bioterrorism

• ENORMOUS EFFECTS OF BIOTERRORISM: MEDICAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, PSYCHOLOGICAL, AND SOCIAL

• OUTCOMES DEPEND ON WHAT AGENT IS USED, IN WHAT FORMULATION, AND THE CONDITIONS OF ITS RELEASE

• IF THE AGENT WAS CONTAGIOUS AND WAS PROFESSIONALLY PREPARED AND RELEASED THEN THE EFFECTS COULD BE BOTH SIGNIFICANT AND LONG-LASTING

• THE EFFECTS OF A SIGNIFICANT BIOTERRORISM ATTACK COULD BE COMPARABLE TO THOSE OF A NUCLEAR ATTACK
2. Potential effects of bioterrorism (continued)

- **THE PSYCHOLOGICAL EFFECTS COULD COMPOUND THE DIRECT EFFECTS, WITH ADDED ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL IMPACTS AS SEEN IN THE ANTHRAX ATTACKS IN THE U.S.**

- **AN AGROTERORRIST COULD HAVE ENORMOUS IMPACTS WITH AN AGENT SUCH AS FOOT AND MOUTH DISEASE**

- **A LESSON FROM HISTORY: THE INFLUENZA PANDEMIC OF 1918-1919 KILLED MORE PEOPLE THAN BOTH WORLD WARS. A NEW SUCH PANDEMIC COULD STEM FROM BIOTERRORISM WITH CATACLYSMIC EFFECTS**

- **HARVARD PHILOSOPHER GEORGE SANTAYANA (1905)**
  “THOSE WHO CANNOT REMEMBER HISTORY ARE CONDEMNED TO REPEAT IT”
3. Potential Al Qaeda use of biological weapons

• AL QAEDA HAS BEEN WORKING ON BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS SINCE 1994 WHEN IT STARTED ITS PROGRAM IN AN ISOLATED FARMHOUSE IN ALBANIA

• AL QAEDA WORKED ON HUMAN BOMBS, INDIVIDUALS WHO WOULD CARRY AND SPREAD A HIGHLY VIRULENT FORM OF A CONTAGIOUS DISEASE SUCH AS BUBONIC PLAGUE
3. Potential Al Qaeda use of biological weapons (continued)

• REPORTS THAT AL QAEDA HAS BEEN SEEKING OTHER BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS, INCLUDING RICIN, ANTHRAX, AND VARIOUS BIOLOGICAL TOXINS

• AFTER THE 9/11 ATTACK THE “AMERICAN TALIBAN” JOHN WALKER LINDH TOLD INTERROGATORS THAT A BIOLOGICAL ATTACK WAS TO BE THE “SECOND WAVE” OF THE AL QAEDA ATTACK ON THE U.S. - STILL POSSIBLE
3. Potential Al Qaeda use of biological weapons (continued)

• RECENT TRENDS IN TERRORIST INCIDENTS INDICATE A TENDENCY TO MASS-CASUALTY ATTACKS FOR WHICH BIOWEAPONS ARE IDEALLY SUITED, AND WHICH AL QAEDA HAS BEEN DEVELOPING

• DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE ADMIRAL DENNIS BLAIR TESTIFIED ON FEB. 25 THAT THE GLOBAL ECONOMIC CRISIS COULD FOSTER EXTREMISM AND TERRORIST STRIKES
3. Potential Al Qaeda use of biological weapons (continued)

• AFTER THE 9/11 ATTACKS, AL QAEDA SPOKESMAN ABU GHEITH WROTE (2002): “WE HAVE NOT REACHED PARITY WITH THEM. WE HAVE THE RIGHT TO KILL 4 MILLION AMERICANS - 2 MILLION OF THEM CHILDREN”

• THIS CANNOT BE DONE WITH 9/11 TYPE ATTACKS, REQUIRES WMD, INCLUDING BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS
4. The evolving nature of transnational terrorism

• TRANSNATIONAL TERRORISM HAS BECOME A POWERFUL AND GROWING FORCE IN THE GLOBALIZED WORLD SYSTEM

• MANIFOLD DIMENSIONS:
  - SECURITY
  - ECONOMIC
  - POLITICAL
  - ENVIRONMENTAL
THAT ALL AFFECT THE FUTURE
4. The evolving nature of transnational terrorism (continued)

- TERRORISM AS THE USE OR THREAT OF USE OF VIOLENCE TO ACHIEVE POLITICAL OBJECTIVES THROUGH INTIMIDATION

- TERRORISM HAS BECOME A GLOBAL PHENOMENON, EVOLVING FROM A NATIONAL OR REGIONAL THREAT INTO A MULTINATIONAL OR GLOBAL ONE
4. The evolving nature of transnational terrorism (continued)

• AL QAEDA HAD OPERATED IN SUDAN THEN AFGHANISTAN AND PAKISTAN AND NOW HAS BRANCHES IN GREAT BRITAIN, MOROCCO, IRAQ, INDONESIA, PHILIPPINES, ETC.

• AL QAEDA HAS LEARNED FROM GLOBAL BUSINESS THE VALUE OF FRANCHISING, USE OF THE INTERNET, ETC.
4. The evolving nature of transnational terrorism (continued)

• BY CONTRAST THE U.S. AFTER THE 9/11 ATTACKS SET UP A HIERARCHICAL ORGANIZATION, THE DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, TO COUNTER AL QAEDA AND OTHER TRANSNATIONAL TERRORIST GROUPS

• DHS WAS SHOWN TO BE DYSFUNCTIONAL IN THE AFTERMATH OF HURRICANES KATRINA AND RITA
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

• JUST AS TRANSNATIONAL TERRORISM HAS BEEN EVOLVING, THE APPROACHES TO COUNTERING IT MUST ALSO EVOLVE, BUT THEY HAVEN’T

• TRANSNATIONAL TERRORISM CANNOT BE TREATED BY ONE GOVERNMENT’S ACTION ALONE, BUT REQUIRES CONCERTED ACTION BY MANY GOVERNMENTS AND PUBLIC AND PRIVATE ORGANIZATIONS
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

• NATIONAL GOVERNMENTS AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS CAN PROVIDE MORE EXTENSIVE MUTUAL SUPPORT TO COUNTER TERRORISM

• THE SAME ACTORS COULD PLAY A KEY ROLE IN PREVENTING TRANSNATIONAL TERRORISTS FROM ACQUIRING RESOURCES OF BIOLOGICAL AGENTS, FUNDING, RECRUITS, WEAPONS, INFORMATION, ETC.
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

• MUTUAL SUPPORT AS AN IMPORTANT MEANS TO COUNTER TRANSNATIONAL BIOTERRORISM, RANGING FROM LOCAL LAW ENFORCEMENT AND FIRST RESPONDERS TO CORPORATIONS, STATES AND REGIONS, UP TO AND INCLUDING NATIONS AND INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

• HISTORICAL EXAMPLE: THE LOS ANGELES RESPONSE TO THE 1906 SAN FRANCISCO EARTHQUAKE AND FIRE
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

- MUTUAL AID AGREEMENTS EXIST, BUT IT IS NOT CLEAR HOW THEY WILL WORK IN THE CASE OF A TERRORIST STRIKE WITH BIOLOGICAL WEAPONS

- EXAMPLES OF MUTUAL SUPPORT AMONG COMPANIES IN RESPONSE TO EMERGENCY SITUATIONS (YOSSI SHEFFI’S “RESILIENT ENTERPRISE”)

- DHS AND OTHER ORGANIZATIONS COULD LEARN FROM THE EXPERIENCE OF LOCAL FIRST RESPONDERS AS WELL AS THAT OF BUSINESS
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

• THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAY TO DEFEAT TRANSNATIONAL BIOTERRORISM IS NOT TO PROTECT VULNERABLE ASSETS SUCH AS DHS FOCUS ON AIRPORTS AND AIRPLANES, BUT TO DEPRIVE TERRORISTS OF THE MEANS OF ATTACK

• MANY OTHER TYPES OF TERRORIST ATTACKS ARE POSSIBLE

• ROLE OF SUBSTITUTION (TERRORISTS WOULD SUBSTITUTE OTHER TARGETS AS SOME ARE PROTECTED)
5. Countering bioterrorism: The role of mutual support

• MUST AVOID THE DENIAL SYNDROME AND TREAT “WORST CASE SCENARIOS” AND DEVELOP WAYS TO PREVENT THEM THROUGH NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION
2009 Milken Institute Global Conference
Measuring Today’s Terrorist Threat

Hon. Philip Coyle
Senior Advisor
Center for Defense Information
April 27, 2009
What is Terrorism?

“The unlawful use of force and violence against persons or property to intimidate or coerce a government, the civilian population, or any segment thereof, in furtherance of political or social objectives.” FBI

*Like pornography, we think we know it when we see it.*
What is Terrorism?

• “All criminal acts directed against a State and intended or calculated to create a state of terror in the minds of particular persons or a group of persons or the general public.”

League of Nations Convention, 1937
Is This Terrorism?

Most Lethal U.S. School Shootings

- **April 20, 1999, Littleton, Colo.** 14 students (including killers) and one teacher killed, 23 others wounded at Columbine High School in the nation’s deadliest school shooting. Eric Harris, 18, and Dylan Klebold, 17, had plotted for a year to kill at least 500 and blow up their school. At the end of their hour-long rampage, they turned their guns on themselves.

- **April 16, 2007, Blacksburg, Va.** A 23-year-old Virginia Tech student, Cho Seung-Hui, killed two in a dorm, then killed 30 more 2 hours later in a classroom building. His suicide brought the death toll to 33, making the shooting rampage the most deadly in U.S. history. Fifteen others were wounded.

- **Feb. 14, 2008, DeKalb, Ill.** Former graduate student killed five students and then himself, and wounded 17 more when he opened fire on a classroom at Northern Illinois University.
“Spy Agencies Say Iraq War Worsens Terrorism Threat.”

• “Indicators of the Spread of the Global Jihadist Movement”
• “The Iraq War has made the overall terrorism problem worse.”

Source, New York Times, September 26, 2006
WMD, Terrorism and Civil Liberties

• “A state of war is not a blank check when it comes to the rights of the nation’s citizens.”
  – Justice Sandra Day O’Connor, June 2004

• “The very core of liberty secured by our Anglo-Saxon system of separation of powers has been freedom from indefinite imprisonment at the will of the executive.”
  – Justice Antonin Scalia, June 2004
Recent Terrorism Trends

• Emergence of “micro-actors,” lower level, smaller cells, and more isolated.
• “Sophistication,” e.g. global flow of information, finance, Internet, cyber.
• Attacks to cause economic damage, e.g. infrastructure, tourism, oil installations.
• Increasing overlap of terrorist activity with international crime, with concomitant law enforcement implications.
• Homegrown. State sponsorship declining?
Recent Terrorism Trends, cont’d.

• Use of readily available resources, e.g. IEDs
• Expressed interest in WMD but no easy access to systems or technology.
• Targets of opportunity, e.g. 9/11 attackers didn’t need to develop the 747, maintain hangars, supply fuel, or flight notification systems.
• Terrorists networks do not operate like the Manhattan Project.
WMD: The New Definition

Cold War

- Nuclear Weapons

Since 9/11/2001

- ‘Dirty’ Radiological Weapons
- Biological Weapons
- Chemical Weapons
- Nuclear Weapons (more later)

Destruction, Disruption or Distraction?
Dirty/Radiological Bombs

- Some people think a “dirty bomb” is worse than a full-scale nuclear explosion, just somehow dirtier
- A dirty bomb produces no nuclear explosion
- Hospital radiation source used for cancer treatment + wrapped in dynamite = a “dirty bomb”. Dynamite might kill a few people but radioactivity would not. Cleanup but not mass destruction.
- Weapons of mass disruption/ weapons of mass distraction
Some “WMD” Do Not Equal “Mass Destruction”

- Chemical and Radiological Weapons
  - Limited Death Toll; contamination, cleanup
  - Disruption of Emergency Response

- Biological Weapons
  - May Have Limited Shelf Life/Stability
  - Hard to “weaponize”
  - Medical countermeasures
  - But 25 lbs of viable Anthrax if broadly distributed: Catastrophic

- Nuclear Weapons
  - > 100,000 Civilian Deaths
  - Local Destruction of Social and Economic Infrastructure for years
Our initial emphasis is on high-consequence bio threats

Radiological/Nuclear Threat Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential Consequence</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear Power Accidents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Reactor Accident</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criticality Incident</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stolen Nukes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Dispersed Radioactive Sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Radiological Waste Dispersal |      |        | +?
| Medium Dispersed Radioactive Sources |      |        |      |
| High Dispersed Radioactive Sources |      |        |      |
Over 1000 Illicit Nuclear Trafficking Incidents

- Since January 1993, 1008 incidents as of December 2006.
- 252 of which were reported in 2006.
- 18 involved Highly Enriched Uranium or Plutonium.

- Fortunately quantities are generally small.
Reported weapons-usable nuclear material seizures

- Podolsk, Russia: 1.5 kg HEU
- Andreeva Guba, Russia: 1.8 kg HEU (35%)
- St. Petersburg, Russia: 3.0 kg HEU (90%)
- Munich, Germany: 400 g Pu (87% Pu-239)
- Batumi, Georgia: 920 g HEU (30%)
- Ruse, Bulgaria: 4 g HEU (72%)
- Paris, France: 2.5 g HEU (72%)
- Georgia: 100 g HEU (~70%)
- Vilnius, Lithuania: 100 g HEU (50%)
- Murmansk, Russia: 4.5 kg HEU (20%)
- Tangen, Germany: 6 g Pu (99.75% Pu-239)
- Landshut, Germany: 0.8 g HEU (87.8%)
- Prague, Czech Republic: 2.7 kg HEU (87.8%)
- Moscow, Russia: 1.7 kg HEU (20%) - Electrostatic Diversion
- Prague, Czech Republic: 0.415 g + 17 g HEU (87.8%)

NOTE: enrichments have not been independently verified for all seizures

As of September 21, 2007
What is the magnitude of this effort at our borders?

On average, at 621 US Border Crossings:
- 320,000 vehicles
- 57,000 trucks/containers
- 2,600 aircraft
- 600 vessels
- 1.1 million passengers enter the United States every day. To protect US interests, estimates of as many as 2400 Radiation Portals would be required to effectively screen 100% of goods with minimal effect to commerce.

“A World Without Nuclear Weapons”

• Schultz, Kissinger, Perry, and Nunn, January 4, 2007, Wall Street Journal:
  • “Most alarmingly, the likelihood that non-state terrorists will get their hands on nuclear weaponry is increasing. In today's war waged on world order by terrorists, nuclear weapons are the ultimate means of mass devastation. And non-state terrorist groups with nuclear weapons are conceptually outside the bounds of a deterrent strategy and present difficult new security challenges.”

• Candidate Obama, October 2007
• President Obama, Prague, April 5, 2009
Attacks with Improvised Explosive Devices (IEDs)

• 2004 = 5,607
• 2005 = 10,953 = ~30 attacks per day
• Nearly double
• July 2005 to January 2006 – 6 months:
• IEDs killed Two-thirds of all U.S. military killed in Iraq
• IEDs caused 78% of all U.S. military wounded.
The Conflict in Iraq
30 Days, 2368 Attacks

- 799 Homemade Bombs
- 664 Mortar and Rocket Fire
- 527 Small Arms Fire
- 272 Rocket Propelled Grenades
- 40 Vehicle Bombs
- 27 Land Mines

High Energy Density Materials

• Easy To Get; Low Tech
• Demonstrated Effectiveness
  World Trade Center
  Oklahoma
  Spain
  Alleged Padilla Plans
• 747 + Fuel = Small Nuclear Explosion

Without Better Controls, This Will Be the Terrorist Threat of the Future as well as Today.
An Ounce of Prevention

• Simple early steps for prevention are more cost-effective in terms of both cost and consequences than elaborate plans after the fact
  For example, 9/11 response

Armored Cockpit Doors vs. Vast Airport Screening
Worldwide terrorism goes up and down depending on our actions and the actions of others, e.g.

- Yasser Arafat’s renunciation of terrorism in 1989 resulted in a sharp decline in terrorist acts by the PLO
- When dissension broke out in the ranks of Abu Nidal, its operations declined
- After the Soviet Union withdrew from Afghanistan, the Afghan Government curtailed its terrorist campaign against Pakistan
- When the United States takes an active role in peace negotiations between Israel and the PLO, or when we step back, terrorism in the Middle East goes down or up accordingly
International Terrorism Incidents

International Terrorism Incidents without India and Iraq for 2004

Dept. of State & NCTC
International Terrorism Incidents
(without India and Iraq 1993-2004)

Source: Dept. of State & NCTC
USG Designated Foreign Terrorist Org’s

- Abu Nidal Organization (ANO)
- Abu Sayyaf Group
- Al-Aqsa Martyrs Brigade
- Ansar al-Sunnah Armed Islamic Group (GIA)
- Asbat al-Ansar
- Aum Shinrikyo
- Basque Fatherland and Liberty (ETA)
- Communist Party of Philippines/New People’s Army (CPP/NPA)
- Continuity Irish Republican Army (CIRA)
- Gama’a al-Islamiyya (IG) HAMAS
- Harakat ul-Mujahadin (HUM)
- Hizballah Islamic Jihad Group (IJG)
- Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU)
- Jaish-e-Mohammed (JEM)
- Jemaah Islamiya Organization (JI)
- Al-Jihad Kahan Chai (Kach)
- Kongra-Gel (formerly Kurdistan Worker's Party (PKK))
- Lashkar e-Tayyiba Lashkar i Jhangvi (LJ)
- Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE)
- Libyan Islamic Fighting Group (LIFG)
- Moroccan Islamic Combatant Group (GICM)
- Mujahadin-e Khalq Organization (MEK)
- National Liberation Army (ELN)
- Palestine Liberation Front (PLF)
- Palestinian Islamic Jihad (PIJ)
- Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP)
- Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine-General Command (PFLP-GC)
- Al-Qaida
- Al-Qaida in Iraq
- Al-Qaida in the Islamic Maghreb (AQIM) [Formerly Salafist Group for Call and Combat (GSPC)]
- Real IRA (RIRA)
- Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia (FARC)
- Revolutionary Nuclei (RN)
- Revolutionary Organization 17 November (17N)
- Revolutionary People’s Liberation Party/Front (DHKP/C)
- Shining Path (SL)
- United Self-Defense Forces of Colombia (AUC)
Today’s Greatest Threats

- Climate change & environmental degradation
- Armed conflict
- Organized crime
- Terrorism
- WMD
- Poverty
- Corruption
- Pandemics
- Fanaticism
- Economic decline
The Homeland Security Challenge

- 20 Year: Problem
- 5 Year: Strategic Plans
- 2 Year: Elected Officials
- 1 Year: Budgets
- 30 Sec: Disasters
Thus we have to rethink…

**The old**
- Deterrence or MAD
- Command and control
- Eliminating terrorism
- Top down
- Short wars

**The new**
- Asymmetric warfare
- Networking
- Managing terrorism
- Bottom up
- The Long War
Metrics & why we haven’t been attacked again

• Virtually impossible to know
• Absence of attack doesn’t mean security worked
• Benchmarking says what others are doing
• Depends on your political affiliation
Recent terrorism has changed

- **Finite not siege** historically (would make our lives untenable)
- **Blurred distinctions** between national & domestic security, war & crime
- **Frontlines** not distinct (i.e. military/civilian)
- **Surprise** highly likely
- **Resources** are limited
Intelligence and law enforcement are worlds apart

**Intelligence**
- Purpose is policy
- Timing is before
- Standard is “good enough…”
- Stay out of evidence chain to protect sources

**Law enforcement**
- Purpose is cases
- Timing is after
- Standard is court of law
- To convict have to make some evidence public
Nassim Taleb’s *The Black Swan*

- Low-probability, high-impact events determine history
- We look at what we are aware of, not those things forgotten in forming that evaluation
- We overestimate what we know and underestimate uncertainty
- Forgotten would be those that might have prevented 9-11
- We act slowly on chronic problems like obesity & the worldwide food shortage
Public Health

Law Enforcement
FBI

Port/train/airport authorities

Doctors

The patient
The exposed
The stressed

Emergency Medical Services

Private business
Think tanks
universities

Government at all levels

Intelligence

The Media
Historical Precedents

- Nuclear Weapon
- Chemical Weapon
- BW Pathogen
- Radioisotopes
- Biotoxins
- Conventional High Explosives
- Oklahoma City
- World Trade Center

Likelihood of Occurrence*

Possible Casualties

- Hiroshima
- The Black Death
- Battle of Ypres
- chemical weapon
- Radioisotopes
- Chernobyl
- Bhopal
- Conventional High Explosives
- Oklahoma City
- World Trade Center
Today’s Greatest Threats + Jared Diamond

- Climate change & environmental degradation
- Armed conflict
- Organized crime
- Terrorism
- WMD
- Poverty
- Corruption
- Pandemics
- Fanaticism
- Economic decline

- Environmental damage inflicted by people
- Enemies
- Changes in friendly trading partners
- Society’s political, economic and social responses to these shifts
The Chinese “crisis” has two characters
Do Interventions Save Money?

- **Proactive - lessens probability of occurrence**
  - Good global surveillance
  - Mass vaccination
  - Intelligence gathering
- **Reactive – lessens impact**
  - Training first responders and medical personnel
  - Stockpiles of supplies
  - Law enforcement and quarantine
  - Medical care and isolation
  - Social distancing
  - Handling the hysteria & personnel shortages
  - A responsible media
Desynchronization & Institutional Katrinas

- FEMA
- Intel failures
- LA County BOS
- DoD/Walter Reed
- Passports & visa exemptions
- Quarantine & XDR tuberculosis
- Handling of Iraq
- The FDA
- Virginia Tech shooting
- Immigration & borders
- Our education system
- Healthcare costs
- Sports
We have to be decisive!
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Their Plan</th>
<th>Our Plan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Networked</td>
<td>• Hierarchical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Global cooperation</td>
<td>• Military emphasis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Encouraging fear</td>
<td>• Worry about fear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• No concern for law</td>
<td>• Obeying the law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Patient</td>
<td>• Hurried</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>